

fear before the enormity of a universe in which God is as present as women and men echo through the contexts treated in these pages.

University of Toronto

KENNETH MILLS

Nostra Aetate: Origins, Promulgation, Impact on Jewish-Catholic Relations. Proceedings of the International Conference, Jerusalem, 30 October-1 November 2005. Edited by Neville Lamdan and Alberto Melloni. [Christianity and History: Series of the John XXIII Foundation for Religious Studies in Bologna, Vol. 5.] (Münster and Berlin: LIT Verlag Dr. W. Hopf; Distrib. Transaction Publishers, Rutgers University, 2007. Pp. xii, 218. €29,90 paperback. ISBN 978-3-825-80678-1.)

The Catholic Church and the Jewish People: Recent Reflections from Rome. Edited by Philip A. Cunningham, Norbert J. Hofmann, S.D.B., and Joseph Sievers. [The Abrahamic Dialogue Series, Vol. 10.] (New York: Fordham University Press, 2007. Pp. xiv, 256. \$50.00. ISBN 978-0-823-22805-8.)

These collections are the products of conferences held to observe the fortieth anniversary in 2005 of the Second Vatican Council's Declaration on Non-Christian Religions, *Nostra Aetate*, specifically its fourth section on the Church's understanding of Jews and Judaism. Both volumes include Jewish and Catholic authors. Both have significance for historians not only of the Council but also of subsequent Jewish-Catholic relations up to the present. The books are complementary, and the student of this history should have both of them.

The volume edited by Neville Lamdan and Alberto Melloni presents the proceedings of a conference held in Jerusalem from October 30 to November 1, 2005, at the Center for the Study of Christianity at Hebrew University. The book is not divided into sections, but the fifteen essays can be roughly divided into equal groups of studies of the history of the text, its impact in the short term, and reflections on it after forty years.

Melloni examines the history of the text and its significance for the Church's reevaluation of its most ancient interreligious relationship. Marco Morselli presented the influence of Jewish historian Jules Isaac and the Amitié Judéo-Chrétienne de France in framing the issues the Council would tackle. In what the editors call "the centerpiece" paper of the conference, Paulist Father Thomas Stransky, the last surviving staff member of the Pontifical Secretariat for Christian Unity that led the drafting of the declaration, presented his "Insider's Story" of the draft's many theological and political adventures before the world's bishops finally enacted it by an overwhelming vote during the last session of the Council. Annarita Caponera presents the results of her two-year study of the Secretariat archives from 1962 to 1965. Uri Bialer narrates "the view from Jerusalem" during the Council and the activities of the Israeli government to influence the outcome.

Serge Ruzer discusses how the theological agenda of *Nostra Aetate* required and precipitated a close look at the Jewish origins of Christianity. Robert Bonfil suggests a hermeneutic of the text from a Jewish perspective that can at once acknowledge it as a "revolutionary" change of Catholic worldview while still affirming its continuity with Catholic theology over the ages. Hans Herman Henrix outlines the effects of the declaration on Catholic attitudes in Western and Eastern Europe. Didier Pollefeyt describes the state of Catholic theology that has replaced a presumption that Christianity has superseded Judaism with an affirmation of the ongoing validity of God's covenant with the Jewish People. Mauro Velati notes the cross-fertilization between Protestant and Catholic thinking on these issues, before and after the Council. Petra Held gives a Protestant perspective on it after forty years, David Rosen provides Israeli perspectives, and Jerome Chanes shows its impact on Catholic-Jewish relations in the United States. Finally, Zwi Werblowski and Cardinal Walter Kasper, the latter president of the Pontifical Commission for Religious Relations with the Jews, sum up Jewish and Catholic perspectives. The volume concludes with an index of names.

Kasper, whose essay was last in the Lamdan and Melloni volume, appears first in the Cunningham, Hofmann, and Sievers volume. He discussed interfaith possibilities with Jews and Muslims in the former; in the latter, he narrates the thirty-year history of the Pontifical Commission for Religious Relations with the Jews. Also providing histories of the commission are Cardinal Jorge María Mejía, Father Pierfrancesco Fumagalli, and Father Norbert Hofmann, all past secretaries of the commission.

This volume is divided into sections. In the first, Riccardo di Segni (the chief rabbi of Rome) and Giuseppe Laras (the chief rabbi of Milan) give Jewish perspectives on the relationship, while Cardinal Carlo Maria Martini provides a Catholic perspective. In the second, Massimo Giuliani deals with the memory of the Shoah as "a shadow upon and a stimulus to" dialogue, as his essay title expresses.

In the third section Archbishop Bruno Forte, Erich Zenger, and Peter Hunermann establish firm foundations for a Christian theology of Judaism. In the fourth section Alberto Melloni, along with the previously mentioned papers by Mejía, Fumagalli, and Hofmann, discusses developments in "the Post-Shoah Catholic-Jewish Dialogue." Finally, Vatican diplomat Cardinal Achille Silvestrini and Israeli diplomat Oded Ben Hur discuss the relationship between the Holy See and the State of Israel.

A helpful set of appendices to this volume includes all six drafts of what became *Nostra Aetate*; Joint Declarations of the International Catholic Jewish Liaison Committee from 1970, 1990, 1994, 1998, 2001, 2004, and 2006; Joint Statements of the Pontifical Commission and the Chief Rabbinate of Israel's Delegation from 2003-06; and the 1993 Fundamental Agreement between



Israel and the Holy See. The volume has a full index and an index of scriptural passages cited.

As someone who lived through much of the history narrated in these two volumes and participated in many of the theological dialogues reflected in their pages, I can only express my delight in and gratitude for them.

*Secretariat for Ecumenical and
Interreligious Affairs (Emeritus)
United States Conference of Catholic Bishops*

EUGENE J. FISHER

A History of Catholic Antisemitism: The Dark Side of the Church. By Robert Michael. (New York: Palgrave Macmillan. 2008. Pp. x, 282. \$74.95. ISBN 978-0-230-60388-2.)

This book lives up to its subtitle, presenting in detail "the dark side" of Christian attitudes toward Judaism and treatment of Jews over the centuries. It occasionally mentions mitigating factors, such as St. Augustine's argument that the Jews witness to the validity of their Bible; are thus necessary to the proclamation of the Gospel; and should therefore, alone among all the non-Christian religions of the Roman empire, be allowed to worship freely. But such acknowledgments are overwhelmed by numerous negative examples, to the point where readers may be unable to answer the following simple question: So why did Jews choose to stay in Christendom, when they could have moved to Islamic or Asian countries? This is a question that the author never asks, most likely because the answer would be an acknowledgment that a true presentation of Jewish-Christian relations over the centuries would have many more bright spots in many countries over many centuries in which Jews lived peacefully and relatively prosperously with their Christian neighbors. But this shade of gray reality is, I fear, beyond the author's intent, which is to show only "the dark side of the Church."

In the introduction (p. 1), the author states that Catholic "as distinguished from 'Orthodox' and 'Protestant,' refers to those Christians who are in communion with the Holy See of Rome." He includes the eastern Church Fathers, such as St. John Chrysostom, as purveyors of "Catholic antisemitism." Martin Luther's anti-Jewish screeds, which were if anything even more vitriolic than Chrysostom, become a key part of the history of "Catholic" antisemitism, since the author, before devoting several pages to him, describes him simply as a "former Augustinian." The book consistently blames the Catholic Church for the anti-Jewishness and antisemitism of all baptized Christians. I am not sure why the author feels the need to do this. Catholic sins are quite sufficient; one does not have to blame the Catholic Church for the sins of others. Alternately, the author could have admitted that what he has really written is a history of Christian, not just Catholic, antisemitism.

Chapter 1, "Pagans and Early Catholics," treats the New Testament, emphasizing its later and more negative passages as what it means overall and often interweaving what the New Testament actually said with what later generations of (gentile) Christians said that it said, so that most readers will find it difficult to distinguish the New Testament from the later "teaching of contempt" of the Fathers of the Church (Augustine excepted) toward the Jews. Subsequent chapters (2 through 5) march chronologically through the centuries, carefully culling out everything negative and for the most part ignoring positive developments. What the author says about the crusades in chapter 5 is summarized in the Postscript (p. 195) as "Every Crusade started out murderously attacking European Jews." Here, he cites the classic studies by Robert Chazan and others of the First Crusade, which was qualitatively different from subsequent crusades in its massacres of Jews and attempts to convert them by force, over the protests of the local bishops, as Chazan reports but Michael fails to mention.

Chapter 6 (pp. 75-100) deals with medieval "Papal Policy" while the final chapter, 10, treats "Modern Papal Policy," especially with regard to the Holocaust. These chapters bracket the countries Germany, Austria-Hungary, France, and Poland. Throughout these presentations, the author heaps up mounds of details, often accompanied by misleading generalizations. To his credit, Michael does attempt a more balanced approach of the question of Pope Pius XII and the Jews than many of Pius's detractors. However, he does not succeed in this attempt, as his vision of "the dark side" seems to predominate, even when he has no evidence to support a given claim. One example is his assertion that the deportations of the Jews from Rome by the Germans continued unabated after Pius's intervention. In fact, the deportations stopped and most of the remainder of the Jews of Rome were saved, often through concealment in Catholic convents and monasteries, which Michael again neglects.

One theme of the book, made explicit in the Postscript, "Catholic Racism," is that there is really no distinction between patristic and medieval Catholic anti-Jewish theological polemics and modern, racial, genocidal anti-Semitism, because the author can find some quotes from some Catholics over two millennia in which Jews were disparaged even after being baptized. The *limpia de raza* laws against converso Jews and their descendants in Spain and Portugal are, tendentially, portrayed as universal Catholic policy encouraged by the bishop of Rome, who, inexplicably, did not adopt them in the Papal States. Yes, these Iberian laws were forerunners of Nazi laws, but they were not enacted outside their particular time and place. Likewise, neither they nor any other of the numerous and noxious things that Christians did to Jews (mostly after 1096 and the First Crusade) ever resembled genocide. Telling Jews that they must convert to stay in a country is not anywhere near the same thing as undertaking to kill all Jews no matter what they do.

The notes to this book (pp. 205-65) are extensive and show the breadth of the author's reading in the field. The index (pp. 267-82) is complete and serviceable.

