

Reviews of History



The Flower and the Scorpion

Sexuality and Ritual
in Early Nahua Culture

PETE SIGAL

Latin America Otherwise
384 pages, 43 illustrations, paper, \$25.95

"A fascinating history of understandings of Nahua sexuality from the precontact era through the early colonial period." —Susan Schroeder, editor of *The Conquest All Over Again: Nahuas and Zapotecs Thinking, Writing, and Painting Spanish Colonialism*

FORTHCOMING FALL 2012

Religion and State Formation in Postrevolutionary Mexico

BEN FALLAW

328 pages, paper, \$24.95

"Fallaw demonstrates how conservative Catholic opposition at the local and state levels consistently obstructed Cardenista reform. . . . His research is blockbuster in every possible way." —Terry Rugeley, author of *Of Wonders and Wise Men: Religion and Popular Cultures in Southeast Mexico, 1800–1876*



order online!
www.dukeupress.edu

July, 2012

VOL. XCVIII, NO. 3

27 FEB. 2014

THE CATHOLIC HISTORICAL REVIEW



THE CATHOLIC UNIVERSITY OF AMERICA PRESS

Vol. XCVIII, No. 3 THE CATHOLIC HISTORICAL REVIEW

July, 2012

In both books Michael Kißener examines the polemical arguments about whether Catholics can be seen as part of the anti-Nazi resistance. On the one hand, numerous priests were imprisoned for trying to oppose Nazi encroachments and persecution. On the other hand, other critics assert that the church leaders were only interested in preserving their own milieu and made no efforts to resist the regime's more virulent crimes. The heroism of the few does not compensate for the complicity of the majority.

In both books Christoph Kösters and Thomas Brechenmacher take issue with criticisms of the German bishops and the pope. They see such critics as engaging in unwarranted expectations or wishful thinking about whether these leaders could or could not have done more to stop the Nazi crimes. The need now is to be more aware of the historical factors conditioning their responses to the unprecedented circumstances they had to face.

In her chapter in the first of these books, Annette Mertens takes issue with Gordon Zahn's contention that the Catholic bishops had misled their followers to support the Nazi criminal war effort with religiously-based justifications. She points rather to the staunchly nationalistic and anti-Communist views of most Catholics that had led them to support Hitler in the first place. No bishop was prepared to challenge such views. Indeed, most of them shared the same attitudes. A more justified censure would be to point to the hierarchy's failure to recognize that their earlier teachings about the conduct of war no longer applied.

In the second book, Mark Ruff's excellent chapter on the Catholic Church and denazification after 1945 shows that the church leaders never accepted any notion of collective guilt. They opposed the sweeping measures taken by the American military government that deprived all Nazi Party members of their livelihoods. The imposition by a foreign power of a set of rules with retrospective penalties was rightly seen as unjust. The Catholic clergy saw it as their pastoral duty to support their parishioners, whatever their past. The bishops were afraid that denazification would lead to further radical measures against the Church, especially in the Soviet-occupied zone. In Ruff's view, their vigorous action was a means of regaining support and credibility for a new beginning.

In both books, the final insightful essay by Karl-Josef Hummel deals with questions of guilt—national, institutional, as well as personal. It was several years before German Catholics were prepared to face up to their history. The striking changes of recent decades have made the task of coming to terms with their own past easier. New historical sources have enabled a more balanced approach rather than one looking for scapegoats. But the importance of the issues can still arouse polemical debates. It is still too soon to say that a consensus has been reached.

University of British Columbia

JOHN CONWAY

«*Cronache Sociali*», 1947-1951. Edizione anastatica integrale. Edited by Alberto Melloni. 2 vols. (Bologna: Istituto per le scienze religiose. 2007. Pp. cii, 1104; 1105-1983, appendix v, with a DVD. €120,00. ISBN 978-8-890-11073-3.)

Giuseppe Dossetti (1913-96)—member of the antifascist resistance, politician, canon lawyer, priest, *peritus* at Second Vatican Council, founder of a religious order, and monk—was one of the most important “public Catholics” in Italy between World War II and the end of the century. In 1945, Dossetti became vice-secretary of the Christian Democratic Party (Democrazia Cristiana), the pivotal center of the political system immediately after the war. In 1953, he founded the “Istituto per le scienze religiose” in Bologna with Giuseppe Alberigo and Paolo Prodi, and served as the closest adviser of Cardinal Giacomo Lercaro, archbishop of Bologna, from the Second Vatican Council until early 1968, when Lercaro had to resign under pressure from Rome for his criticism of the Vietnam War.

More than fifteen years after his death, Dossetti still is an inspiring figure for many Italian Catholics, including those who are politically active. To understand Dossetti's contribution to Italian Catholicism and Italian politics, it is necessary to go back to the journal he founded, *Cronache Sociali*. In the long introduction (pp. XIII-XLIV), the editor, Alberto Melloni (now director of the study center founded by Dossetti and based in Bologna), reconstructs the prehistory of *Cronache Sociali* and Dossetti's engagement in the reconstruction of Italian politics. This history begins in 1942, when Dossetti met with colleagues from the Università Cattolica del Sacro Cuore in Milan. The introduction follows step by step the short life of the journal, from its inception in 1947 (after the ousting of the leftists from Alcide De Gasperi's administration at the outset of the cold war) to its closing in 1951 (when Dossetti decided to withdraw from the leadership of the Christian Democratic Party as well as direct political engagement and return to historical-theological research).

The editorial of the first issue of the journal, published on May 30, 1947, announced the mission of *Cronache Sociali*:

We do not want to escape from a commitment to give social and political assessments, and indeed we make that commitment. But we do not interpret this commitment as restricted to the analysis of petty politics, but rather concerned in finding the connections between politics and the living substance of the problems of contemporary man. This research and evaluation is now, in our opinion, the true and greater politics, a *human politics*. (n.p., emphasis in original)

During those four and a half years, *Cronache Sociali* tried to capture and transmit to politically minded Italian Catholics the movements and ideas coming from Europe, especially from France and Germany; this approach made *Cronache Sociali* a kind of Italian equivalent (although short-lived) of

Emmanuel Mounier's Paris-based journal *Esprit* or Walter Dirks's Frankfurt periodical *Frankfurter Hefte*. The sections of the journal included "national politics," "chronicles from Parliament," "international affairs," "economy," "life of political parties," "workers unions," "culture," and "sociology." Contributors to *Cronache Sociali* included Vittorio Bachelet (a major leader of Catholic Action in Italy), philosopher Augusto Del Noce, Giorgio La Pira (mayor of Florence), patrolologist Giuseppe Lazzati, Emmanuel Mounier, and David Maria Turoldo. Their articles offer a very interesting window into post-World War II Italy and especially the politically and theologically "progressive" Christian Democratic Party that was therefore critical of De Gasperi's caution toward domestic politics and foreign policy, especially in matters pertaining to the United States.

The last issue of *Cronache Sociali*, published on October 31, 1951, opened with an editorial that was harshly critical of De Gasperi's political action to restore Italian political life:

At this moment, given the actual functioning of the executive branch, it would be inaccurate to characterize the Italian Republic as a "parliamentary democracy" (given the special autonomy claimed by the executive before the Parliament) or as a "parliamentary popular democracy" (as it is in Great Britain). For now, we have to stop with this negative characterization . . . while we wait for a real restoration of a parliamentary democracy. (n.p.)

The journal closed not only because of Dossetti's exit from politics but also because of the growing tensions within its editorial staff.

The chronological index, subject index, and author index facilitate consultation of the articles. The two bulky volumes plus a DVD reprint all the articles published by the journal that tried to open new frontiers for a reform of Italy, especially in the relationship among government, the economy, and Catholic culture.

University of St. Thomas, St. Paul

MASSIMO FAGGIOLI

American

A History of the Catholic Church in the American South, 1513-1900. By James M. Woods. (Gainesville: University of Florida Press. 2011. Pp. xviii, 498. \$69.95. ISBN 978-0-813-03532-1.)

Citing James O'Toole's *The Faithful: A History of Catholics in America* (Cambridge, MA, 2008) as a recent example of Catholic historians who "have tended to overlook their own denomination within the South" (p. xiii), James Woods sets out to provide a concise, well-documented overview of Southern Catholicism through 1900. Woods's South extends beyond the eleven

Confederate states to include Maryland, West Virginia, Kentucky, and Tennessee. Southern Catholicism forms "a tapestry of faith. . . a rich heritage of Roman Catholicism that had been present in the southern region since the sixteenth century" (p. xv).

Part I, "The Colonial Context, 1513-1763," explores Catholic origins in Spanish Florida, Spanish Texas, French Lower Louisiana, and the English Colonies. Part II, "American Republicanism and European Decline, 1763-1845," examines Southern Catholics in the new American republic, church and state as European empires erode, and the Church in the expanding South. Part III, "Resistance, Rebellion, Reconstruction and Regionalism, 1845-1900," concludes with a chapter on growth, expansion, and the limited role of Catholic immigrants compared to the North.

Woods, who has written extensively on Arkansas Catholicism, weaves his tapestry from modern scholarship, census data, and original documents into a readable narrative. The growth of the local church is interspersed with numerous thumbnail sketches of the early bishops; of clergy such as Jeremiah O'Neill (a priest of Savannah), Thomas O'Reilly (a Georgia priest who served at the notorious Andersonville prison camp), and Abram Ryan (priest-poet of the Confederacy); of religious men and women such as St. Katharine Drexel of the Sisters of the Blessed Sacrament, Mercy Sister Austin Carroll, and Capuchin Father Antonio de Sedella of New Orleans; and of laity such as Charles Carroll, Daniel Rudd (whose life is traced after the five national Congresses of Colored Catholics), and William Joseph Gaston (called "the most highly respected Catholic in antebellum North Carolina," p. 247).

Woods's narrative is enriched with frequent, interesting details such as Bishop Dionisio Resino's 1709 appointment as La Florida's first resident bishop and his rapid departure, the state-by-state expansion of religious freedoms in the early Southern colonies, the beginnings of Georgetown University, the 1850 and 1860 status of Irish immigrants in the South, the fate of the three Maryland Catholics associated with John Wilkes Booth, and the Little Rock diocesan archives document explaining Bishop Edward Fitzgerald's vote against papal infallibility at the First Vatican Council. He also delves beneath the chronological narrative with analysis such as the negative impact of the Spanish colonial practice of conscripted Indian labor on the early missionary endeavor.

The author provides present-day landmarks for early locations and events. The 1597 Guale Indian revolt against the Spanish began in the village of Tolomato, "on the Georgia mainland near present-day Harris Neck near Sapelo Island" (p. 12).

Modern scholarship is cited throughout the volume: Diana Meyers on the role of women in seventeenth-century Maryland; Carl Brasseaux on Acadian religious practices; Clyde Crews concerning Bishop Benedict Joseph Flaget's